
**CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION**

**January 9, 2020
Regular Session – 4:00 PM
Minutes**

City Hall • 3rd Floor, Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Bob Broom, Paul Bouknight, Harris Cohn, Sanford Dinkins, Michel Moore, Angi Fuller Wildt

Members Absent: Ashley Johnson, Tom Savory

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Megan McNish, Kristina Poston, Johnathan Chambers, Andrea Wolfe

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 4:00 PM by Vice-chairperson Bob Broom. Roll call, quorum established.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the agenda since publication. She then proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA DESIGN/HISTORIC

- 1. 141 Edisto Avenue** (TMS# 11310-02-04) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 141 Edisto Avenue complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

- 2. 329-331 Picadilly Street** (TMS# 08909-02-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Granby Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 329-331 Picadilly Street generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

- 3. Bull Street Campus, Laundry Building** (TMS#11404-10-04) Request for recommendation of approval for landmark designation. *Pending Individual Landmark*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the Laundry Building complies with Section 17-691(d) of the City of Columbia Zoning Ordinance and **supports a positive recommendation for a Group III Landmark.**

4. **950 Harden Street** (TMS# R11405-07-01) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill and exterior alterations. *Five Points National Register District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 950 Harden Street generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

5. **948 Harden Street** (TMS# R11405-07-25) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Five Points National Register District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 948 Harden Street generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

6. **940 Harden Street** (TMS# R11405-07-21) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Five Points National Register District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 940 Harden Street generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

7. **938 Harden Street** (TMS# R11405-07-20) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Five Points National Register District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 936-938 Harden Street generally complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

8. **1300 Pickens Street** (TMS# 11402-11-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *City Center Design/Development District*

WITHDRAWN

9. **808 King Street** (TMS# 11316-02-01) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area.*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 808 King Street generally complies with Section 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

10. **1328 Laurel Street** (TMS# 09015-08-03) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District/Landmark District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposed new construction at 1328 Laurel Street is generally in keeping with Sec. 17-674 of the City Ordinance and Section 5.4.2 of the City Center Design Guidelines and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- Brackets to be shortened with final design approval deferred to staff;
- Details for windows, doors, brick, and fence to be provided to staff with final design approval deferred to staff;
- Any future signage to be approved by staff;
- All other details deferred to staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

December Minutes

Motion by Mr. Broom to approve the Consent Agenda as it stands and the meeting minutes from December.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Vote taken. Motion passes 6-0.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to move into Executive Session for legal counsel with regard to 117 Lincoln Street, as well as the items listed for Executive Session on the agenda.

Motion seconded by Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 6-0.

III. EXECUTIVE SESSION

The receipt of legal advice where the legal advice relates to a pending, threatened, or potential claim, pursuant to S.C. Code Section 30-4-70(a)(2).

- Bullstreet Development, LLC vs. City of Columbia Design/Development Review Commission
- General Federation of Women's Clubs of South Carolina vs. City of Columbia Design/Development Review Commission

Motion by Mr. Broom to move out of Executive Session. No action was taken.

Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn. Motion passes 6-0.

IV. REGULAR AGENDA DESIGN

1. **1600-1620 Gervais Street** (TMS# 11401-09-01, 03, 05) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, stated one presentation would be made for 1600-1620 Gervais Street however two motions would be required as there was a request for Certificate of Design Approval and a request for Site Plan Approval.

Ms. Statler introduced the request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction for an 8-story multi-family residential building with below-grade parking.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposal substantially meets the City Center Design Guidelines, and **recommends approval conditional upon the following items be reviewed and approved** (by staff or the Commission, at the Commission's discretion):

- The design be considered with brick up to the top floor and/or more brick be considered on rear elevations;
- The depths and projections of exterior features, material adjacencies, and the depth of rear elevation windows be increased significantly;
- Some planting or other method be used to soften or add interest to the transformer screen on Gervais Street;
- Any roof-mounted utility equipment be located so as not to be viewed from the public right-of-way;
- All other details be reviewed and approved by staff.

2. **1600-1620 Gervais Street** (TMS# 11401-09-01, 03, 05) Request for Site Plan Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Johnathan Chambers, Land Development Administrator, provided an overview on the request for Site Plan Approval for the demolition of existing building on the site and construction of a 276-units apartment building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Should the Commission be inclined to grant approval of the site plan, staff would request that the Commission **grant approval subject staff comments**. Staff recommends for approval with conditions listed in the case summary which relate to planning/urban design, zoning, land development, building code, utilities, traffic engineering, forestry, and stormwater requirements.

Linda Irving with Trinitas Ventures, and the development manager for the project, presented the request. Ms. Irving stated building design input received from staff, the University Hill Neighborhood president, and the University architect had been very help and provided positive direction in the design of the project. In addition, a traffic impact analysis was completed by professional engineer Mike Ridgeway.

Bruce Todd, civil engineer with RB Todd, spoke on the site.

Mark Cotterill, landscape architect with Grimball Cotterill, spoke landscape, sidewalks and trees.
HED architects, Gene McDonald and Bernard Vilza, spoke on the materials, windows, and façade.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.

In opposition of the request:

Tom Gottshall, president of the University Hill Neighborhood Association
Robin Waites, Executive Director of Historic Columbia
Derek Gruner, UofSC architect
John Magill, neighborhood resident
Beth Richardson, neighborhood resident
Katherine Fenner, vice-president of the University Hill Neighborhood Association
April Lucas, neighborhood resident
Douglas Carlisle, neighborhood resident
John Stucker, neighborhood resident
Bobby Lyles, Columbia architect

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Ms. Fuller Wildt to deny the request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction at 1600-1620 Gervais Street within the City Center Design/Development District. Reasons for denial are based on the mass and scale and use of the building being incompatible with the adjacent University Hill historic district. Motion seconded by Mr. Bouknight. Motion passes 6-0.

Motion Ms. Fuller Wildt to deny the request for Site Plan Approval for new construction at 1600-1620 Gervais Street within the City Center Design/Development District. Reasons for denial are based upon the mass and scale of the parking. Motion seconded by Mr. Bouknight. Motion passes 6-0.

3. 1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Ms. Statler introduced the request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction for the development of a 15-story private student dormitory building with structured parking. The applicant received a Special Exception from the Board of Zoning Appeals in December to increase the residential density from the code allowance of 150 beds/acre. The proposal includes 405 on-site parking spaces.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds guidelines that there are a number of issues that need attention in order to substantially meet the City Center Design Guidelines, and **recommends deferral of the request in order to addresses the following:**

- Provide a comfortable pedestrian realm with the architecture of the building's lower floors and the design of the space around the building; Sections 5.3, 5.4.1, and 5.4.2

- Break up the vertical mass of the building and provide horizontal articulation to relate to adjacent context; Sections 5.3.2, 5.3.4
 - Relocate some service functions in order to provide more active uses on the street frontage; design pedestrian-oriented storefronts at street level; Sections 5.3.5, 5.7.1, 4.4
 - Consider the distribution of materials and the fenestration pattern on the upper floors in order to integrate the volumes of the building and add interest to the upper façade; Sections 5.7., 5.8.2
4. **1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street** (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Site Plan Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Mr. Chambers introduced the request for Site Plan Approval which entails the construction of a private dormitory on 0.97 acres. The proposed private dormitory consists of 206-units. The required number of parking spaces for this development is 509 whereas the applicant proposes to provide 405 within the parking garage and 104 parking spaces within 400 feet of the development. The required number of bicycle parking spaces is 170 whereas 175 will be provided.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Should the Commission be inclined to grant approval of the site plan, staff would request that the Commission **grant approval subject staff comments**. Staff recommends for approval with conditions listed in the case summary which relate to planning/urban design, zoning, land development, building code/permitting/ encroachments, utilities, traffic engineering, forestry, and stormwater requirements.

Mark Lecocq, senior vice-president for Clayco Realty Group (CRG), introduced the project team and the request.

Andrew Savoy, project manager, spoke on the proposed project and site plan.

Robert Neely, senior architect, spoke on the design.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to defer the applicant’s request for Site Plan at 1401 Assembly Street to a subcommittee at a date to be coordinated with staff, the applicant and the Commission to work to resolve issues as they pertain to access on the site with the trash on Assembly Street and pedestrian access on the sidewalks.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 6-0.

Ms. Statler clarified for the public record that no action is taken in a subcommittee meeting, it is a working session. Any decision made regarding the project will be heard at the subsequent public hearing by the D/DRC.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to defer the applicant’s request for a Certificate of Design Approval at 1401 Assembly Street for the approval of new construction to a subcommittee at a date to be coordinated with staff, the applicant and the Commission to specifically to address the staff recommendations with breaking up the vertical mass of the building, providing horizontal articulation and to relate to the

adjacent context; Sections 5.3.2, 5.3.4, with respect to the site plan as well, relocating some of the service functions in order to provide more active uses on the street frontage and pedestrian oriented frontages at street level; Sections 5.3.5, 5.7.1, 4.4, and overall consider the distribution of materials and the fenestration pattern on the upper floors in order to integrate the volumes of the building and add interest to the upper façade; Sections 5.7., 5.8.2.

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Motion passes 6-0.

HISTORIC

5. 1700 block of Calhoun Street, intersection of Calhoun and Talley Streets

Rehearing request for a request for Certificate of Design Approval for modifications to the landmarked Wall on the former State Hospital Grounds (currently the Bull Street Neighborhood), appeal to a staff decision. *Individual Landmark*

6. 117 Lincoln Street (TMS# 08913-08-04) Rehearing request for a request for a Certificate of Design Approval for site improvements, appeal to a staff decision. *Whaley Street Protection Area*

Megan McNish, preservation planner, introduced the rehearing request for an appeal to a staff decision. The applicant came to the Design/Development Review Commission meeting in November of 2019 for approval of a parking area that had been installed without design approval. The DDRC voted at that meeting to deny the request. The applicant has since submitted a new application, however since the scope of the work had not changed, the applicant was not making a new request but essentially asking for a rehearing.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the application does not comply with the Design/Development Review Commission's bylaws, Section 8, and **recommends a denial of the request for a rehearing.**

John Ecton, property owner, presented the request for rehearing.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.

Joe Wider, Granby Mill neighborhood resident and vice-president of the Granby Mill Neighborhood Alliance, voiced support of staff decision.

As no one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to approve the applicant's request for rehearing at 117 Lincoln Street based on the prior session's situation with a misunderstanding of fact for off-street parking. Mr. Cohn stated for the record that his motion should not be construed as any kind of future approval.

Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. Motion fails with 4-1-1 with four members (Mr. Bouknight, Mr. Dinkins, Ms. Fuller Wildt, Mr. Broom) in opposition, 1 member (Mr. Cohn) in approval, and 1 member (Ms. Moore) in abstention.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to deny the request for rehearing at 117 Lincoln Street based upon the fact the application does not comply with the Design/Development Review Commission's bylaws, Section 8.

Motion seconded by Mr. Bouknight. Motion passes 4-1-1 with 4 members (Mr. Bouknight, Mr. Dinkins, Ms. Fuller Wildt, Mr. Broom) in favor, 1 member (Mr. Cohn) in opposition, and 1 member (Ms. Moore) in abstention.

7. **2200 Hampton Street** (TMS# 11407-14-01) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for an addition. *Waverly Protection Area.*

Megan McNish, preservation planner, introduced the request for an addition and site improvements for the circa 1952 structure, home of Good Samaritan-Waverly Hospital from 1952 through 1973. The addition to the original structure is being undertaken as a part of the rehabilitation of the original structure.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the new construction and site improvements at 2200 Hampton Street generally complies with Section V of the Waverly guidelines and Section 17-674(f) of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:**

1. The walls of the clerestory and brick first story should align;
2. The two levels of the awning as viewed from Hampton Street should align;
3. Further information be provided with final approval deferred to staff for the following items:
 - a. Awning design;
 - b. Window and door design and glazing;
 - c. The junction between the brick on the Hampton Street elevation and the front openings on the Pine Street elevation;
 - d. The metal cornice, louvered and prefinished metal panels;
 - e. Location and screening of ground and roof mounted utilities;
 - f. The design of the wood privacy fence and brick wall;
4. All other details deferred to staff.

Jerome Simons, architect for the project, presented the request stating the addition is being designed to be a studio and a memorial to the Emmanuel 9 to honor Reverend Clementa Pinckney who was a graduate of Allen University. Mr. Simons then spoke on the design of the project, stating similar lines and materials from the original building will be used.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Ms. Fuller Wildt to grant a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions for 2200 Hampton Street within the Waverly Protection Area:

- **The walls of the clerestory and brick first story should align;**
- **Further information be provided with final approval deferred to staff for the following items:**
 - a. **Awning design, with the exclusion of the window design;**
 - b. **Window and door design and glazing;**
 - c. **The junction between the brick on the Hampton Street elevation and the front openings on the Pine Street elevation;**

- d. The metal cornice, louvered and prefinished metal panels;
- e. Location and screening of ground and roof mounted utilities;
- f. The design of the wood privacy fence and brick wall; and
- All other details deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Motion passes 6-0.

8. **1211 Heidt Street** (TMS# 11410-01-16) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Waverly Protection Area.*

Megan McNish, preservation planner, introduced the request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition of a circa 1923 two story, wood sided, Craftsman influence residence with a hip roof and hip dormer.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the demolition request at 1211 Heidt Street is not in keeping with Section IX of the Waverly guidelines and **recommends denial**. Repairs to the property should be undertaken, with approval from staff or the DDRC as necessary, within 90 days.

Willie Williams, agent for the church, presented the request for demolition. He also provided a letter in support of the demolition from Roger Davis, resident.

William Pyatt, church member and legal advisor for the church, spoke in favor of the request.

Members of the public were invited to speak in favor or opposition of the request.

Frank Houston, president of Historic Waverly, voiced opposition to the request for demolition.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to deny the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition at 1211 Heidt Street based upon the request for demolition is not in keeping with Section IX of the Waverly guidelines and recommendations.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt.

Motion amended by Mr. Cohn to retain the motion and amend the motion to include that the property should have repairs undertaken, with approval from staff or the DDRC as necessary, within 90 days.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 6-0.

9. **1101 Pine Street, Chappelle Memorial AME Church** (TMS# 11406-09-13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for an addition. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A*

DEFERRED

10. **2212 Senate Street** (TMS# 11410-22-06) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A*

Ms. Moore stated the request was presented at the previous month's meeting and was deferred as the applicant was not in attendance. There is no new information available at this time and the applicant was not in attendance for the current meeting.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposed new construction in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly

Protection Area located at 2212 Senate Street is generally in keeping with Section IV of the Design Guidelines and Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance. Staff **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:**

- The form and ratio of the front facade should be more in line with historic examples.
 - Extend the left bay forward to meet the right gabled wing.
- All windows to be consistent in size and spacing:
 - Windows on the front elevation adjusted to be consistent in size;
 - Windows along the left elevation to include three single or two paired windows;
 - Windows along the right elevation to include a combination of paired and single windows or four single windows;
 - Final design approval of rhythm of openings deferred to staff.
- All other details deferred to staff.

Motion by Mr. Cohn to allow the applicant one more chance to make the recommended changes by working with staff and to defer the request for approval at 2212 Senate Street.

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Motion passes 6-0.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Broom.

Motion seconded by Mr. Bouknight. Motion passes 6-0.

Meeting adjourned at 7:25PM.



Chairperson

Respectfully submitted

Planning and Development Services Department

2.13.2020

Date