
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN/DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION

June 11, 2020

Regular Session (Virtual) – 4pm.

Minutes

Members Present: Bob Broom, Sanford Dinkins, Chloe Jaco, Angi Fuller Wildt, Chloe Jaco, Ashley Johnson, Tom Savory

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Kristina Poston, Andrew Livengood, John Fellows, Megan McNish

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 4:04PM by Chairperson Tom Savory. Mr. Savory noted the virtual forum and explained methods of access by the public to the meeting. Ms. Moore also noted how the public could participate in the following ways:

- a. Watching the live stream through CityTV accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/user/ColumbiaSCGovernment>
- b. Emailing letters or statements to cocboardmeeting@columbiasc.gov, which would be monitored throughout the meeting and will be read into the record at the appropriate time.
- c. Phoning 855-925-2801 and entering the meeting code 8938 with three options to speak
 - i. (star one) *1 will allow you to listen
 - ii. (star two) *2 will allow you to record a voice mail message that will be read into the record
 - iii. (star three) *3 will allow a participant to be placed in a queue, so they may speak live when prompted.
- d. Virtual Participation by joining the meeting on the web at <https://publicinput.com/COCDDRC-June2020>

Roll call, quorum established.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the agenda. She then proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

DESIGN/ HISTORIC

1. **1724 Enoree Avenue** (TMS# 11306-07-17) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Wales Garden Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 1724 Enoree Avenue complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

2. **1208 Princeton Street** (TMS# 13901-05-13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction of an accessory structure. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposed garage at 1208 Princeton Street is in keeping with Section V of the Melrose Heights/ Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District Design Guidelines and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with all details deferred to staff.

3. **2409 Preston Street** (TMS# 11409-10-19) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposed new construction in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area located at 2409 Preston Street is in keeping with Section IV of the Design Guidelines. Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval and all details deferred to staff.

4. **1639-45 Main Street** (TMS# 09014-10-05, -06) Request for preliminary certification of the Bailey Bill and Certificate of Design Approval for exterior alterations. *Columbia Commercial Historic National Register District/City Center Design/Development District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the exterior changes at 1639-1643 and 1645 Main Street generally complies with Section 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- Specifications for the replacement windows be provided to staff for approval;
- Staff will assess the windows found in storage in 1645 Main Street for to assess whether or not they were original or be provided with photographic evidence of the windows in situ during the period of significance;
- Specifications for the storefront system and glazing be provided to staff for approval;
- Final door design and materials be submitted to staff for approval;
- The new storefront for 1639-1643 replicate the details seen in the photograph on page 6 of this evaluation as closely as possible;
- Samples for new features including storefront details, cornice, and exterior wall finishes will be provided to staff for approval;
- Test samples of the mortar and paint remover will be provided to staff for assessment;
- All other details, including signage, deferred to staff.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the repair project at 1639-1643 and 1645 Main Street generally complies with Section 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

May Minutes

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to approve the Consent Agenda as well as the May 14th Meeting Minutes.

Motion seconded by Ms. Jaco. Roll call vote taken. Motion passes 6-0.

Ms. Moore noted changes to the regular agenda, the deferral of case 1 under the Urban Design portion of the regular agenda, case 3 and 6 under the historic portion of the regular agenda.

There was a 3-minute pause for technical difficulties.

III. REGULAR AGENDA DESIGN/HISTORIC URBAN DESIGN

1. 1600-1620 Gertrude Street (TMS# 11401-09-01, 03, 05, 08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

DEFERRED

HISTORIC

2. **1700 block of Calhoun Street, intersection of Talley and Calhoun Streets**
Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior alterations. *Individual Landmark*

Amy Moore, preservation planner, introduced the request to modify the existing section of the Bull Street wall at the 1700 block of Calhoun Street, intersection of Calhoun and Talley Streets.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposal to modify the existing section of the Bull Street wall at the 1700 block of Calhoun Street, intersection of Calhoun and Talley Streets, is in keeping with Section 17-674(d) of the City of Columbia Zoning Ordinance, and recommends conditional approval based upon the following:

- Given that more traffic will be increasing at this opening with the proposed modification and given the number of past vehicular accidents which have impacted historic features on the campus and the wall itself, staff recommends that bollards be placed on all sides of the opening to protect the wall;
- That the removal of the brick and the column will follow specifications as provided by staff but which will include supports for the wall during the deconstruction, hand chiseling the original brick and/or concrete from the wall, a mortar analysis, and retention of the original brick as proposed by the applicant for repairs;
- Staff strongly encourages that the applicant make every effort to repair the Bull Street wall along Elmwood Avenue (where sections are missing and covered with plywood), and that this repair work should be started immediately using any recovered brick (and more if needed), and also using mortar analysis and staff guidance;

- That staff work with the applicants on the re-creation of the concrete column and its details;
- That if there is any failure of the historic wall as a result of the proposed work, the historic wall will be appropriately repaired or restored immediately;
- If approved, the understanding is that Hughes Company has confirmed that a third entry along Calhoun Street will not be pursued and that a historic plaque will be mounted regarding the Bull Street Campus and/or its wall—staff would recommend a historic marker in its stead to be mounted in the public right-of-way;
- All details deferred to staff.

Chandler Cox, representative for the Hughes Development Corporation, introduced the request.

Mr. Broom asked about the pedestrian experience exiting the Bull Street district.

Mr. Dinkins requested clarification on whether or not Calhoun and Talley Streets were City or DOT streets.

Mr. Savory paused for several minutes for comments from the public. Mr. Fellows noted that there were no calls, voicemails, or emails regarding this case.

Mr. Savory asked Ms. Cox if the Hughes Development Corporation was in agreement with all of the conditions for approval outlined by staff in the project evaluation. Ms. Cox confirmed.

Motion by Ms. Jaco that the D/DRC grant a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior alterations at the 1700 Block of Calhoun Street with the staff conditions:

- Given that more traffic will be increasing at this opening with the proposed modification and given the number of past vehicular accidents which have impacted historic features on the campus and the wall itself, staff recommends that bollards be placed on all sides of the opening to protect the wall;
- That the removal of the brick and the column will follow specifications as provided by staff but which will include supports for the wall during the de-construction, hand chiseling the original brick and/or concrete from the wall, a mortar analysis, and retention of the original brick as proposed by the applicant for repairs;
- Staff strongly encourages that the applicant will make every effort to repair the Bull Street wall along Elmwood Avenue (where sections are missing and covered with plywood), and that this repair work should be started immediately using any recovered brick (and more if needed), and also using mortar analysis and staff guidance;
- That staff work with the applicants on the re-creation of the concrete column and its details;
- That if there is any failure of the historic wall as a result of the proposed work, the historic wall will be appropriately repaired or restored immediately;
- If approved, the understanding is that Hughes Company has confirmed that a third entry along Calhoun Street will not be pursued and that a historic plaque will be mounted regarding the Bull Street Campus and/or its wall—staff would recommend a historic marker in its stead to be mounted in the public right-of-way;
- All details deferred to staff.

Mr. Savory amended the motion to state the following: to grant a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior alterations at the 1700 Block of Calhoun Street with the following conditions:

- Given that more traffic will be increasing at this opening with the proposed modification and given the number of past vehicular accidents which have impacted historic features on the campus and the wall itself, staff recommends that bollards be placed on all sides of the opening to protect the wall;
- That the removal of the brick and the column will follow specifications as provided by staff but which will include supports for the wall during the de-construction, hand chiseling the original brick and/or concrete from the wall, a mortar analysis, and retention of the original brick as proposed by the applicant for repairs;
- D/DRC strongly encourages that the applicant will make every effort to repair the Bull Street wall along Elmwood Avenue (where sections are missing and covered with plywood), and that this repair work should be started immediately using any recovered brick (and more if needed), and also using mortar analysis and staff guidance;
- That staff work with the applicants on the re-creation of the concrete column and its details;
- That if there is any failure of the historic wall as a result of the proposed work, the historic wall will be appropriately repaired or restored immediately;
- If approved, the understanding is that Hughes Company has confirmed that a third entry along Calhoun Street will not be pursued and that a historic plaque will be mounted regarding the Bull Street Campus and/or its wall—a historic marker in its stead to be mounted in the public right-of-way;
- All details deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Motion passes 5-0. Ms. Johnson did not vote due to technical difficulties.

Ms. Johnson was able to reconnect and noted she wished to vote yes. Motion passes 6-0.

3. 1209-1211 Gadsden Street (TMS# 08912-07-06, -14) Request for preliminary certification of the Dairy Bill and Certificate of Design Approval for exterior alterations. *West Gervais Street Historic Commercial District*

DEFERRED

4. 3217 Amherst Avenue (TMS# 13804-10-08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for an addition. *Oakwood Court Architectural Conservation District*

Rachel Walling, preservation planner, introduced the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for an addition at 3217 Amherst Avenue in the Oakwood Court Architectural Conservation District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Should the D/DRC find the site of the addition in keeping with the guidelines, with mitigating factors in mind, staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- A compatible material, such as lapped cement fiberboard or brick, be used for siding in place of board and batten siding;
- Windows be wood or aluminum clad windows with exterior muntins;

- All other details deferred to staff.

Chad Johnson, property owner, presented the request.

Mr. Savory paused for public comments, as there were none, Mr. Savory asked if any of the other commissioners had questions for the applicant.

Mr. Savory requested clarification from Mr. Johnston regarding the board and batten siding versus the usage of lap siding.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to grant the request for a Certificate of Design Approval the addition at 3217 Amherst Avenue with the conditions that:

- A compatible material, such as lapped cement fiberboard or brick, be used for siding in place of board and batten siding;
- Windows be wood or aluminum clad windows with exterior muntins;
- All other details deferred to staff.

Mr. Savory amended the motion to state the following:

To grant the request for Certificate of Design Approval at 3217 Amherst Avenue based on the consideration of the mitigating circumstances and based on Section X of the Oakwood Court Architectural Conservation District design guidelines with the follow conditions:

- A compatible material, such as lapped cement fiberboard, be used for siding in place of board and batten siding;
- Windows be wood or aluminum clad windows with exterior muntins;
- All other details deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. Motion passes 6-0

5. 1108 Queen Street (TMS# 11409-08-07) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A*

Kristina Poston, preservation planner introduced the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction at 1108 Queen Street in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the proposed new construction in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area located at 1108 Queen Street is generally in keeping with Section IV of the Design Guidelines and Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance. Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- That the siding in the front facing gable be changed to better exemplify historic examples in the district. Earlier plans submitted by the applicant showed synthetic shingles in the front facing gable and this would be in keeping with the guidelines.
- All other details deferred to staff.

Wayne Fisher, representative for Hurricane Builders, was sworn in to discuss the project.

Mr. Savory requested clarification on whether or not the applicant was willing to change the board and batten detail, which Mr. Fisher confirmed and therefore did not present

It was stated for the record that there were no public comments.

Motion by Ms. Johnson that in accordance with Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Design guidelines and Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance to grant a Certificate of Design Approval with the following caveats:

- The siding in the front facing gable should be changed to exemplify historic examples in the district. And we have agreed upon synthetic shingles, as they comply with the guidelines before referenced;
- All other details deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. Motion passes 6-0.

6. 2614 Kiawah Avenue (TMS# 11314-15-06) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Shandon Community Character Area*

DEFERRED

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Moore noted that Mr. Bouknight has resigned from the Commission leaving two vacant positions, one for a community member at large and another for a realtor.

V. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Ms. Fuller Wildt.

Motion seconded by Mr. Sanford. Motion passes 6-0.

Meeting adjourned at 5:10PM.



Chairperson

Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department