
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION

March 12, 2020

Regular Session – 4:00 PM

Minutes

City Hall • 3rd Floor, Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Bob Broom, Paul Bouknight, Sanford Dinkins, Chloe Jaco, Tom Savory, Angi Fuller Wildt

Members Absent: Ashley Johnson

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Megan McNish, Kristina Poston, Andrea Wolfe, John Fellows, Johnathan Chambers

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 4:12PM (technical delay) by Chairperson Tom Savory.

Mr. Savory stated that members of the public not in attendance were allowed to email in any comments for up to five minutes after the last person spoke at the public meeting about a given project. Staff would read the comments to the Commission for public record and applicants would then be allowed time for rebuttal.

Roll call, quorum established, applicants sworn in.

Ms. Moore noted the agenda stood. She then proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA **DESIGN/ HISTORIC**

- 1. 1619 Sumter Street** (TMS# 09014-04-04) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Columbia Commercial National Register Historic District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 1619 Sumter Street complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill** with the following conditions:

- Window and storefront details to be adjusted to match historic images with final approval deferred to staff;
- Additional details related to flashing be submitted to staff with final approval deferred to staff;
- Details related to proposed cleaning technique be submitted to staff with final approval of technique deferred to staff;
- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

Staff **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval** for the project at 1619 Sumter Street based on Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance, with the following conditions:

- Window and storefront details to be adjusted to match historic images with final approval deferred to staff;

- Additional details related to flashing be submitted to staff with final approval deferred to staff;
 - All other details deferred to staff.
2. **1412 Shirley Street** (TMS# 13902-08-10) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*
STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:
 Staff finds that the proposal for new construction at 1412 Shirley Street is generally in keeping with Section V of the Melrose Heights/ Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District Design Guidelines and Section 17-674 of the City Ordinance and **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:**
- Openings on the side elevations to be adjusted to create a consistent rhythm of openings, similar to staff recommendation drawing, with final design approval deferred to staff;
 - Final garage door design and material use to be consistent with neighborhood patterns with final design approval deferred to staff;
 - All other details deferred to staff.
3. **926 Harden Street** (TMS# 11405-07-17) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction *Five Points Urban Design District*
STAFF RECOMMENDATION:
 Staff finds that the project is in substantial compliance with the Five Points Urban Design Guidelines, and **recommends approval with condition** that the following items are reviewed and approved by staff prior to permitting:
- Roof mounted utility equipment and screening;
 - Signage.
4. **1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street** (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Certificate of Site Plan Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*
STAFF RECOMMENDATION:
 Though there are many staff comments within this case summary, the proposed site plan largely meets requirements. Should the Commission be inclined to grant approval of the site plan, staff would request that the Commission **grant approval subject staff comments.**

Ms. Moore stated for the record that a letter of support was received for item #2, **1412 Shirley Street.**

There were no requests to have any items removed from the Consent Agenda.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

February 7, 2020 Special Called Meeting Minutes

February 13, 2020 Minutes

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to approve the Consent Agenda as well as the February 7th Special Called Meeting Minutes and the February 13th Meeting Minutes.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Roll call vote taken. Motion passes 6-0.

Mr. Savory announced a five-minute recess 4:15PM to verify the technical receipt of email comments was working. Meeting resumed at 4:20PM.

Mr. Savory stated for clarification for those who may be making comments via email that the purview of the D/DRC is limited, and does not relate to building use or zoning requirements.

Also not in D/DRC purview is speculation on financial viability or future viability of a project. Comments being made should stay within D/DRC purview as related to design purview and, in this case, site plan purview.

Ms. Moore reviewed the process for those who wished to submit comments. Comments for the respective case were to be emailed to: cocboardmeeting@columbiasc.gov.

III. REGULAR AGENDA DESIGN/HISTORIC URBAN DESIGN

- 1. 1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street** (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the request for Certificate of Design Approval for the development of a 15-story private student dormitory building with structured parking.

The project presented to the D/DRC January 2020, and deferred by the Commission to a sub-committee to discuss outstanding concerns. A publically advertised sub-committee was held on January 21st where a number of items were discussed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Based on the changes that were implemented since January hearing and the subcommittee, staff finds that the project is in substantial compliance with the design guidelines and **recommends approval with the following conditions:**

- That the circulation tower on the Assembly Street elevation be pushed out a few inches to add depth to the façade;
- That sconces, public art, and other architectural details be added to the Washington Street ground level façade and the southwest corner to enhance the pedestrian experience;
- That tall columnar trees be planted on the western side of the parking garage for screening;
- That the applicant work with staff on the design of the open space between the dormitory and the library;
- That these conditions and other details be deferred to staff.

Andrew Savoy, developer (Clayco Realty Group); Robert (Bob) Neely, in-house architect (Lamar Johnson Collaborative); and Jay Case, principal (Clayco Realty Group) presented the request.

Members of the audience were invited to speak regarding the request.

Ms. Statler stated for the record that a letter of support was received from Matt Kennell on behalf of City Center Partnership who represents properties owners in the Main Street District.

As no one in attendance spoke for or against the request, and no additional emails received, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Savory to grant a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction for 1401-1431 Assembly Street and 1011-1019 Washington Street (TMS # 09013-03-01, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13) with the following conditions:

- That the circulation tower on the Assembly Street elevation have incorporated into it reveals either side, corbeling on the masonry between the windows, and an expression of a sill on each one of those windows;
- That sconces, public art, and other architectural details be added to the Washington Street ground level façade and the southwest corner to enhance the pedestrian experience;
- That tall columnar trees be planted on the western side of the parking garage for screening;
- That the applicant work with staff on the design of the open space between the dormitory and the library;
- That these conditions and other details be deferred to staff

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Roll call vote taken. Motion passes 6-0.

Mr. Savory noted procedures to be followed regarding the requests for Certificate for Site Plan Approval and Certificate for Design Approval for **1600-1620 Gervais Street**.

He stated that Design Approval is a separate case in terms of building, massing and design of the building itself, and is not part of the Site Plan Approval process. Each request would be heard separately as a case presentation, heard separately in discussion, and as a vote separately by the D/DRC.

Mr. Savory reiterated as stated earlier that the purview of the D/DRC is limited, and does not relate to building use or zoning requirements. Also not in D/DRC purview is speculation on financial viability or future viability of a project. Comments being made should stay within D/DRC purview as related to design purview and, in this case, site plan purview.

2. 1600-1620 Gervais Street (TMS# 11401-09-01, 03, 05, 08) Request for Certificate of Site Plan Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Johnathan Chambers, land development administrator, introduced the request for site plan approval of a project that entails the demolition of existing buildings and the construction of a 426,000 sq. ft., 8-story, 276-unit apartment building at the southeast corner of Gervais Street and Pickens Street. The required number of parking spaces is 480 whereas the applicant proposes to provide 348 spaces within the parking garage and 132 through existing public parking spaces as allowed per the City Center Design District. Bicycle parking will be provided within the parking garage as well.

Mr. Chambers stated that it is felt staff comments provided are generally standard and the proposed site plan largely meets requirements.

Lyndy Bryant and Cliff Moore, attorneys of Adams and Reese LLP, represented the applicants Trinitas, on both requests.

Linda Irving, Trinitas representative, then presented on the request for Certificate of Site Plan Approval.

Bruce Todd, civil engineer, spoke on building alignment.

Mike Ridgeway, engineer, prepared and spoke on traffic study.

Member of the public were invited to speak regarding the request.

Opposition:

Patrick Hubbard, law school professor
John McGill, director of University Hill Neighborhood
Katherine Fenner, resident

Break taken 5:09 PM to 5:13PM to allow for receipt of email comments.

Mr. Fellows clarified the rezoning request of C-3 for the proposal, and spoke on surrounding zoning in the area.

Mr. Fellows stated for the record that letters in support of the request had been received and included in Commission packets noted as Exhibits.

Four additional letters of support were received after the agenda posted. Letters were in support of both Site Plan Approval and Certificate of Design Approval.

Letters were read by Mr. Fellows for the record:

Bruce Harper, Trinity Partners and former D/DRC member
Peyton Bryant, NAI Columbia
Carl Blackstone, Columbia Chamber
Dave E. Massey, Columbia attorney

As no one else in attendance spoke for or against the request, and no additional emails received, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to grant a Certificate of Site Plan Approval for new construction of a 276-unit apartment building located at 1600-1620 Gervais Street in the City Center Design/Development District with all the conditions set forth in the case summary for the aforementioned project.

Motion seconded by Ms. Jaco. Roll call vote taken.

Motion passes 5-1 (Mr. Bouknight in opposition).

3. 1600-1620 Gervais Street TMS# 11401-09-01, 03, 05, 08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the request for proposal of new construction of an 8-story multi-family residential building with below-grade parking.

•
STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposal substantially meets the 19 City Center Design Guidelines, and **recommends approval conditional upon the following items be reviewed and approved (by staff or the Commission, at the Commission's discretion):**

- Section 5.7.2 - The design be considered with brick up to the top floor and/or more brick be considered on rear elevations;
- Section 5.3.5 - The depths and projections of exterior features, material adjacencies, and the depth of rear-elevation windows be increased significantly;
- Section 4.4 - Some planting or other method be used to soften or add interest to the transformer screen on Gervais Street;
- Section 5.3.6 - Any roof-mounted utility equipment be located so as not to be viewed from the public right-of-way; and

- All other details be reviewed and approved by staff.

Linda Irving of Trinitas, developer for the project, presented the request.

Bernard Vilza, design architect, spoke on the design of the project and referenced improvements made based on staff comments.

Lyndy Bryant, attorney for the project, spoke about the project as it relates to the overlay districts and the surrounding context.

Members of the public were invited to speak regarding the request.

Tom Gottshall, president of University Hill Neighborhood Association and resident, spoke in opposition on behalf of neighborhood association.

Ms. Bryant, attorney, spoke in rebuttal to comments made by Mr. Gottshall.

Mr. Dinkins thanked Mr. Gottshall for attending three meetings and voicing his concerns as well as with those of the neighborhood. He reminded more discussion with regard to specific design elements of concern, rather than height and mass, should be points of concern. It appears the neighborhood is focusing on height, mass, influx of people, and not specific design.

Mr. Bouknight left the meeting before the conclusion of case at 5:55PM. Quorum retained.

John Sheer, on behalf of Robin Waites, Executive Director of Historic Columbia, (concerns with scale, mass, height). Mr. Sherer voiced concerns with setbacks.

Mr. Vilza, design architect, spoke in rebuttal with regard to C-3 zoning and setbacks as allowed for the proposal by zoning.

Mr. Hubbard noted a new drawing was included that had not been in the previous presentation. He voiced concerns with design of the building as it did not appear to be all brick.

Ms. Statler said new drawings were presented at this meeting to address staff comments.

Mr. Vilza stated the building will be full brick on Gervais and Pickens Streets, 30 feet around the corner toward the back will be brick and then transition into fiber cement.

Opposition:

Patrick Hubbard, law school professor
Dan D'Alberto, UoSC consultant on behalf of Derek Gruner
Bobby Lyles, resident
Kathryn Fenner, resident

As no one else spoke, testimony closed.

Break taken 6:12PM to allow for receipt of email comments/meeting resumed 6:17PM.

No additional emails were received for the request.

Staff reminded the four additional letters of support received after the agenda posted read previously were in support of both Site Plan Approval and Certificate of Design Approval.

Bruce Harper, Trinity Partners and former D/DRC member
Peyton Bryant, NAI Columbia

Carl Blackstone, Columbia Chamber
Dave E. Massey, Columbia attorney

As no one else in attendance spoke for or against the request, and no additional emails received, testimony closed for board discussion.

Ms. Statler clarified that while some changes were presented today, it was at the Commission's discretion to consider the changes today; the application being considered is the proposal that was included in the Commission's packet.

Board discussion. Mr. Savory commented about his concerns with the project.

Staff requested a brief recess at 6:31PM. Meeting resumed at 6:35PM.

Ms. Statler noted that based on precedents with past projects, the D/DRC cannot require a reduction in the allowable height or allowable building envelope as permitted by Zoning.

Board discussion resulted in possibility of a subcommittee meeting, which is of public record, to work through concerns with applicant and the Commission.

Ms. Bryant asked for a brief recess to discuss the possibility of a subcommittee with applicants.

Brief recess at 6:48PM. Meeting resumed at 6:55PM

Ms. Bryant stated that the applicants agreed to a work session.

Mr. Gottshall felt a work session was an unlikely solution.

Motion by Mr. Savory to defer the project until a work session can be held to further develop the project based on concerns expressed by the Commission with the possibility of the application returning.

Motion seconded by Mr. Dinkins. Motion passes 5-0.

Recusal by Mr. Dinkins from discussion and vote on item #4, 1000-1014 Lady Street and 1218 Park Street. Quorum retained.

4. 1000-1014 Lady Street and 1218 Park Street (TMS# 09013-09-01, 02, 04, 22) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the request for new construction for a 4-story, 144-room hotel and 38 on-site surface parking spaces.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the proposal substantially meets the City Center Design Guidelines, and **recommends approval conditional upon the following items be reviewed and approved by staff:**

- Increase upper floor glazing percentages on the "B" bays facing Lady and Park Streets;
- Increase upper floor window depths to minimum 4" depth, at least on the brick façade;
- Work with Forestry and Beautification to incorporate more shade trees on Lady Street;
- All other details deferred to staff.

Mary Beth Branham, LS3P principal architect and office leader, presented the request for a new Cambria Hotel in the Vista. Though not all could be in attendance because of the virus situation, Ms. Branham introduced the design build team of McCrory, LS3P team, and Choice / High Side

- owners team, and legal team of Nexsen Pruet. She stated that all are in agreement with staff comments.

Darren Holcombe, Cox and Dinkins, spoke on the site for the project.

Ms. Branham spoke on the exterior design of the proposed hotel.

David Anderson, LS3P architect, spoke on the architecture.

Layton Lord, legal for the project, stated meetings were held with the Vista Guild and the Vista Neighborhood Association, who both provided letters of support for entitlement (parking variance) and for design of the proposed project.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request.

Mr. Fellows stated an email was received from Abby Ness of the Vista Guild voicing support of The Vista Guild for the project.

Testimony then closed for board discussion.

Motion by Ms. Fuller Wildt to approve the request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction at 1000-1014 Lady Street and 1218 Park Street in the City Center Design/Development District with the following items to be reviewed and approved by staff:

- **To Increase upper floor glazing percentages on the “B” bays facing Lady and Park Streets;**
- **To Increase upper floor window depths to minimum 4” depth, at least on the brick façade;**
- **Work with Forestry and Beautification to incorporate more shade trees on Lady Street;**
- **All other details deferred to staff.**

Motion amended by Mr. Savory to create window opening treatments on the south and east facades, three either side of the stair corridor in each case.

Motion seconded by Mr. Broom. Motion passes 4-0.

Mr. Dinkins returned to be seated.

HISTORIC

5. **3024 Kershaw Street** (TMS# 13902-09-18) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

Rachel Walling, preservation planner, introduced the request to keep vinyl windows to a contributing structure to the Melrose Heights/ Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the request for Certificate of Design Approval to keep vinyl windows within the west gable of 3024 Kershaw Street is **not in keeping with Section VII** of the Melrose Heights/ Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District design guidelines and **recommends denial of the request.**

The applicant provided additional information consisting of photos numbered 1 through 7 to Commission members at the meeting.

Michael Field, property owner, presented the request that he be allowed to keep the windows.

As no one spoke in favor or opposition of the request, testimony closed for board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to deny the request at 3024 Kershaw Street for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes as the changes are not in keeping with Section VII of Melrose Heights/Oak Law Architectural Conservation District design guidelines and recommend the windows be replaced and all details be deferred to staff.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 5-0

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Moore stated elections for Chairperson and Vice-chairperson were due.

Mr. Savory was re-elected as Chairperson.

Mr. Dinkins was elected as Vice-chairperson.

Both terms are for one year.

V. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Mr. Sanford.

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller Wildt. Motion passes 5-0.

Meeting adjourned at 7:31PM.



Chairperson

Date

Respectfully submitted

Planning and Development Services Department