
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION

May 14, 2020

Regular Session – 4:00 PM

Minutes

City Hall • 3rd Floor, Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Bob Broom, Sanford Dinkins, Ashely Johnson, Angi Fuller Wildt, Chloe Jaco, Tom Savory

Members Absent: Paul Bouknight

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Rachel Walling, Andrew Livengood

I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order at 4:02PM via Zoom, City livestream, and the public input website by Chairperson Tom Savory.

Ms. Moore also noted how the public could participate in the following ways:

- a. **Watching** the live stream through CityTV accessed at <https://www.youtube.com/user/ColumbiaSCGovernment>
- b. **Emailing** letters or statements to cocboardmeeting@columbiasc.gov, which would be monitored throughout the meeting and will be read into the record at the appropriate time.
- c. **Phoning** 855-925-2801 and entering the meeting code 8657 with three options to speak
 - i. (star one) *1 will allow you to listen
 - ii. (star two) *2 will allow you to record a voice mail message that will be read into the record
 - iii. (star three) *3 will allow a participant to be placed in a queue, so they may speak live when prompted.
- d. **Virtual Participation** by joining the meeting on the web at <https://publicinput.com/COCDRC-May2020>

Ms. Moore called the roll, quorum established.

Mr. Dinkins recused himself from case 2 on the Regular Agenda, 3426 Monroe Street a request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition.

Ms. Moore noted that there were no changes to the agenda.

Ms. Moore then proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

DESIGN/ HISTORIC

1. [415 Harden Street](#) (TMS# 11311-03-08) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Individual Landmark*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 415 Harden Street complies with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- a. That a detail is to be worked out with staff to differentiate the existing wall from the addition;
 - b. All details deferred to staff.
2. [Laundry Building, Bull Street Campus](#) (TMS#11404-10-04) Request for preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill and Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Pending Individual Landmark*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the Laundry Building project (TMS#11404-10-04) complies with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- c. That all window and door details be worked out with staff;
- d. That any signage review be deferred to staff;
- e. All other details deferred to staff.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends granting preliminary certification of the Bailey Bill for the Laundry Building project based upon Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance, with the following conditions:

- f. The building receiving landmark status from City Council;
- g. The property meeting or exceeding the required 20% investment threshold;
- h. All other details being deferred to staff.

3. [1813 Main Street](#) (TMS# 09082-01-01 through -05, 09082-02-01 through -03, 09082-03-01 through -03, and 09082-04-01 through -49) Request for preliminary certification of the Bailey Bill and Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Pending Individual Landmark/ City Center Design Development District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that 1813 Main Street complies with Sec. 17-674(d) of the City Ordinance and recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval with the following conditions:

- i. That all window and all door details be worked out with staff;
- j. That all cleaning procedures be conducted in accordance with NPS Technical Preservation Brief #1;
- k. That any signage review be deferred to staff;
- l. All other details deferred to staff.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends granting preliminary certification for the project at 1813 Main Street based upon Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance, with the following conditions:

- m. The building receiving landmark status from City Council;
- n. The property meeting or exceeding the required 20% investment

4. [1501 Hagood Avenue](#) (TMS# 11414-09-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for an addition and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project at 1501 Hagood Avenue complies with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and recommends granting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill with the following conditions:

- The project meeting or exceeding the 20% investment threshold requirements for qualified rehabilitation expenses;
- All work meeting the standards for work as outlined in Section 17-698;
- All details deferred to staff.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for the project at 1501 Hagood Avenue as proposed based on its conformance with Sec. 17-698 of the City Ordinance and Sections VI and V of the Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District design guidelines, with all details deferred to staff.

5. [1320 Melrose Heights Street](#) (TMS# 11414-05-29) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for new construction at 1320 Melrose Heights Street based on its conformance with Section V of the Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District design guidelines with the following conditions:

- Windows to be wood or aluminum clad windows with exterior muntins; window proportions to be consistent in each elevation; trim to use simple header and sill details and brick mold if applicable;
- Height of garage door to align with adjacent windows and door;
- Garage door design to be consistent in style with house and be submitted to staff for final review;
- All other details deferred to staff.

6. [926-934 Harden Street, 907-923 Walnut Street, 2100-2104 Pendleton](#) (TMS# 11405-07-03, 04, 05, 06, 07, 17, 18, 19, 23, 26) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction and site improvements *Five Points Urban Design District*

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that the project is in substantial compliance with the Five Points Urban Design Guidelines, and recommends approval with condition that the following items are reviewed and approved by staff prior to permitting:

- Landscape and lighting plans;
- Pedestrian routes and open spaces;
- Roof mounted utility equipment and screening; and
- Signage.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

March Minutes

Mr. Savory asked if any member of the DDRC or public wished to pull an item from the Consent Agenda and paused for several minutes to provide opportunity for public comment.

Andrew Livengood noted that there were no public comments from the public input site regarding any items on the Consent Agenda.

Motion by Ashley Johnson to adopt the Consent Agenda as presented as well as the March minutes.

Motion seconded by Chloe Jaco. Roll call vote taken. Motion passes 5-0.

**III. REGULAR AGENDA
URBAN DESIGN**

1. [550 Assembly Street](#) (TMS#11303-11-07) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for signage; appeal to staff decision. *City Center Design/Development District*

Lucinda Statler, urban design planner, introduced the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for signage in the City Center Design/Development District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends denial of the appeal based on the proposal being inconsistent with Section 6.3 of the guidelines, wall signs.

Nathan Leaphart, applicant, presented the request for approval of the signage.

Joel Hamrick, sign contractor, presented the request for approval of the signage.

Mr. Savory paused for public comment.

Mr. Savory noted his agreement with staff's concerns and provided an assessment of the South State Bank signage.

Motion by Mr. Dinkins to deny a Certificate of Design Approval for signage at 550 Assembly Street based on the proposal being inconsistent with Section 6.3 of the guidelines, wall signs.

Motion seconded by Ms. Johnson. Roll call vote taken. Motion passes 5-1-0, with Mr. Broom abstaining.

HISTORIC

2. 3426 Monroe Street (TMS# 13802-07-04) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Shandon Community Character Area*

Amy Moore, preservation planner, introduced the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition in the Shandon Community Character Area.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Per Columbia City Code Section 17-674(e), staff recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition, finding the poor structural condition of the building at 3426 Monroe Street to be a principal concern.

Jason and Rachel DeBacker, property owners, presented on the request for demolition.

John Strevins, consultant, presented on the request for demolition.

Mr. Savory clarified with Ms. Moore regarding whether the new design would return to the DDRC. Ms. Moore responded that plans for new construction will not return to the Commission, however, the plans are a component of demolition review.

Mr. Savory paused for public comment.

Mr. Livengood read into the record a letter of opposition from John Sherrer with Historic Columbia.

Garret Gibson, resident of Shandon, spoke in opposition of the demolition and questioned whether the proposed design could be guaranteed.

Ms. Moore responded that the Commission uses the the provisional design for demolition review criteria but that subsequently there is no design review for new construction in Community Character Areas.

Ms. Moore read into the record letters of support from John Meyers, the president of the Shandon Neighborhood Council, Ellen Gundman.

Mr. Livengood played into the record a voicemail from Jane Downey stating she would be adversely affected by the length of the demolition and construction.

There was a pause for further public comment.

Mrs. DeBacker responded to Ms. Downey’s questions and other concerns.

Mr. Savory, Mr. Broom, and Ms. Johnson noted the overwhelming systemic issues for this structure. Ms. Fuller-Wildt requested that the applicants clarify the cost for rehabilitation versus new construction.

Motion by Ms. Johnson to grant the request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition at 3426 Monroe Street per Columbia City Code Section 17-674(e), due to the poor structural condition that is systemic, the economic impact, and the other factors discussed as related to Section 17-674(e).

Motion seconded by Ms. Fuller-Wildt. Roll call vote taken. Motion passed 5-0.

3. 2614 Kiawah Avenue (TMS# 11314-15-06) Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. **DEFERRED** Shandon Community Character Area

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Moore noted that there was no other business.

V. ADJOURN

There being no further business, motion to adjourn by Ms. Fuller-Wildt. Motion seconded by Ms. Johnson. Motion passes 6-0.

Meeting adjourned at 5:12PM.

Chairperson



Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department