



CITY OF COLUMBIA PLANNING COMMISSION

June 1, 2020

Regular Session 5:15 P.M.

Virtual meeting using video conferencing technology

Columbia, SC

In attendance: James Frost II, LaTrell Harts, Ford Tupper, Dale Stigamier, April James, Isa Mandell

Absent: Craig Waites, Harris Cohn

Staff: John Fellows, Shane Shaughnessy, Andrew Livengood, Krista Hampton, Rachel Bailey, Johnathan Chambers, Leigh DeForth

I. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order at 5:16pm by Chairman Dale Stigamier. John Fellows, Planning Administrator, reviewed ways for the public to participate in the virtual meeting. Mr. Fellows called roll; a quorum was established.

Dr. Isa Mandell joined the meeting.

Chairman Stigamier reviewed the format and ways to communicate during the virtual meeting.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

Approval of Minutes

1. Approve May 4, 2020 Minutes

Comprehensive Plan Map Amendment

& Zoning Map Amendment for Pending Annexation

2. **ANNEX-2020-0006: 2125 Apple Valley Road; TMS# 07502-01-03;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Large Lot (UER-2) and assign zoning of General Residential District (RG-1). The property is currently classified as Mixed Residential (High Density) and zoned RM-MD by Richland County.
3. **ANNEX-2020-0007: 4521 Broad River Road; TMS# 06205-02-11;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Community Activity Corridor (AC-2) and assign zoning of Light Industrial District (M-1). The property is currently classified as Mixed Use Corridor and zoned GC by Richland County.
4. **ANNEX-2020-0008: 120 Metal Park Drive; TMS# 16200-04-12;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Industrial (IND) and assign zoning of Light Industrial District (M-1). The property is currently classified as Economic Development Corridor and zoned M-1 by Richland County.
5. **ANNEX-2020-0009: 810 Sparkleberry Lane; TMS# 25705-11-09;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Regional Activity Corridor (AC-3) and assign zoning of General Commercial District (C-3). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density)/Mixed Use Corridor and zoned GC by Richland County.
6. **ANNEX-2020-0010: 156 Island View Circle; TMS# 28907-01-09;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Large Lot (UER-2) and assign zoning of

Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned PDD by Richland County.

7. **ANNEX-2020-0011: 1.70 acres, County Line Trail; TMS# 31700-01-06;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Large Lot (UER-2) and assign zoning of Development District (D-1). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned RU by Richland County.
8. **ANNEX-2020-0012: 18.02 acres, County Line Trail(p); TMS# 31700-01-04(p);** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Small Lot (UER-1) and assign zoning of Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned M-1 by Richland County.
9. **ANNEX-2020-0013: 20.74 acres, County Line Trail; TMS# 28900-01-35;** Request recommendation to annex, assign land use classification of Urban Edge Residential Small Lot (UER-1) and assign zoning of Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned PDD by Richland County.

Site Plan Review

10. **SPLAT-2020-0043: ±86.30 acres, Intersection of Shady Oaks Road and County Line Trail, TMS#28900-01-18, 31700-01-04(p), and 31700-01-06(p);** request site plan approval to construct a 160-**DEFERRED** lot single-family residential development (The Ellington Subdivision, Phase I). The properties are zoned PUD-R (Residential Planned Unit Development) and RU (Rural) in Richland County.

Street Names

11. **SN-2020-0004: Street Name Request – Name streets within the Ashcroft Residential Subdivision = - Ashcroft Circle, Nolton Way, Midbrook Drive, Solandra Drive, Snead Lane, Verona Way, Semoran Way, Larkner Drive, Brockway Drive, Underhill Drive, Clairmeade Drive, Durwin Way, Appian Way, Ludlow Lane, Kearce Drive, Garwood Drive, Calluna Lane, TMS#25700-02-03.**
12. **SN-2020-0005: Street Name Request – Name a street within the Shop Grove Commercial Subdivision - Ranger Point Court, TMS#16200-04-18.**

Mr. Fellows, Planning Administrator, proceeded with review of the consent agenda. Mr. Fellows indicated that Item 10 on the agenda, SPLAT-2020-0043: ±86.30 acres, Intersection of Shady Oaks Road and County Line Trail, TMS#28900-01-18, 31700-01-04(p), and 31700-01-06(p), had been deferred.

Ms. April James made a motion to approve the consent agenda as amended (items 1-9, and 11-12), and Ms. Latrell Harts seconded the motion. The motion was passed by unanimous vote.

Mr. Fellows asked Andrew Livengood to review public comment for the consent agenda. Mr. Livengood and Mr. Fellows verified that no one from the public wished to speak on the consent agenda, so the motion could stand.

III. REGULAR AGENDA

Zoning Map Amendment

13. **ZMA-2020-0010: Wheeler Hill PUD (0.23 acres E/S Rice St., 426 Pickens St., 425 Henderson St., 423 Henderson St., 421 Henderson St., 419 Henderson St., 1615 Rice St., 1613 Rice St., 1611 Rice St., 1605-07 Rice St., 1603 Rice St., 416 Pickens St., 418 Calway Aly., 429 Calway Aly., 424 Calway Aly., 428 Calway Aly., 0.12 acres N/S Calway Aly., 427 Calway Aly., 425 Calway Aly., 423 Calway Aly., 400 Calway Aly.(p), 407 Pickens St., 0.63 acres N/S Phelps St., 0.71 acres N/S Catawba St., 312 Pickens St., 314 Pickens St., 318 Pickens St., and approx. 0.5 acre of portion of Phelps St); TMS# 11307-12-09, 11307-13-01, 11307-13-03, 11307-13-04, 11307-13-05, 11307-13-06, 11307-13-**

14, 11307-13-15, 11307-13-16, 11307-13-17, 11307-13-18, 11307-13-21, 11307-13-22, 11307-13-23, 11307-13-24, 11307-13-25, 11307-13-26, 11307-13-27, 11307-13-28, 11307-13-29, 11307-13-30(p), 11307-14-07, 11307-18-05, 11307-19-01, 11307-19-06, 11307-19-07, 11307-19-08, and 11307-21-01(p); Request to rezone the parcels from Planned Unit Development-Residential District (PUD-R) to General Residential District (RG-2).

Mr. Fellows reviewed the application for the Commission. David Tuttle, the applicant, reviewed his application for the Commission. Dr. Mandell asked Mr. Tuttle to clarify his role; he is the developer and owner of the parcels shown, having purchased these parcels from U of SC, with the exception of the parcel to the northwest of Pickens and Rice. Rachel Bailey, Zoning Administrator, clarified that the additional PUD-R zoning on adjacent parcels is actually tied to two separate PUDs, and these parcels will not be affected by this application.

Chairman Stigamier asked for public comment. Mr. Livengood indicated that he had two emails.

Mr. Jack G. "Gil" Hendrix, Jr. 424 Henderson Street, submitted comments via email.

Mr. Jim Daniel, President, Wheeler Hill Neighborhood Association, submitted comments via email.

Chair Stigamier asked if this proposed development would return to the Planning Commission for review. Ms. Bailey noted that she believed the plan for the development was cluster housing, and if so, that would return to the Planning Commission for review. Mr. Tuttle confirmed that was the case, and that the site plan was still under design/revision and believed any concerns would be addressed.

Mr. Livengood indicated that no additional speakers from the public.

Dr. Mandell asked Mr. Tuttle to readdress his response regarding on-street parking, citing technical difficulties.

Mr. Tupper asked if the property was within a design overlay district. Mr. Fellows indicated that the property was not in a design overlay, but the cluster housing plan would address massing and scale. Mr. Tuttle indicated that there would be an HOA and Architectural Review Board as part of the HOA.

Mr. Frost moved to approve rezoning as requested, and Mr. Tupper seconded the motion. The motion was carried by unanimous vote.

14. ZMA-2020-0012: 3209 N. Beltline Blvd., TMS# 14004-01-09; Request to rezone the parcel from Single-Family Residential District (RS-2) to Office and Institutional District (C-1).

Mr. Fellows reviewed the application, noting that staff has recommended the Planning Commission recommend denial. Mr. Carey Shealy, the applicant, with Statewide Security Measures, indicated he would like to locate his office on the property. Dr. Mandell asked staff for clarity regarding the recommendation to deny, and Mr. Fellows indicated that this was tied to both the future land use and zoning in the area, as well as concerns regarding commercial encroachment. Mr. Tupper asked the applicant to review his business model; Mr. Shealy indicated there were generally four employees, working regular business hours on site, and that they would often be in the field. Ms. Harts asked if there was a business or home beside the empty lot. Mr. Shealy indicated that there was a business immediately touching the property to the left, which is a State Farm Insurance business, but he didn't believe they were in business anymore, and that there was a rental property to the right.

Chairman Stigamier asked for public comment. Mr. Livengood indicated a caller wished to speak. Ms. Vonda Wright indicated she was calling about item #17. There being no further public comment, Chairman Stigamier asked for a vote.

Dr. Mandell clarified that this request was a rezoning request, and was not specific to the business proposed by Mr. Shealy. Mr. Fellows confirmed this was the case.

Chairman Stigamier called for a motion. Dr. Mandell moved to recommend denial of the application to rezone. Ms. Harts seconded the motion. Mr. Fellows called the roll. AYE: Mandell, Harts, James; NAY: Stigamier, Tupper, Frost. The motion failed 3 to 3.

Mr. Stigamier asked for a new motion. Ms. James made a motion to recommend approval of the request. Mr. Frost seconded the motion. The motion passed 4 to 2 (AYE: James, Stigamier, Tupper, Frost; NAY: Harts, Mandell).

- 15. ZMA-2020-0013: 1527 Lyon Street, NX1513 Lyon Street and 1510 Ontario Street (1513 Lyon Street), TMS# 11411-03-01, 11411-03-02, and 11411-03-03;** Request to rezone the parcel from General Commercial District (C-3) to General Residential District (RG-2).

Mr. Fellows reviewed the application for the Commission. Cindy Herrera, Senior Vice President of Development, represented the applicant. Chairman Stigamier asked for public comment regarding the application. Mr. Livengood indicated that no public comment had been received regarding this item. Mr. Fellows asked for follow up questions from the Planning Commission.

Chairman Stigamier asked for a motion. Ms. James made a motion to recommend approval of the application to rezone. Mr. Tupper seconded the motion. The motion passed by unanimous vote.

Mr. Fellows indicated that item #16, **SPLAN-2020-0009: 2440 thru 2484 Forest Drive, 1513 and 1519 McDuffie Avenue, 2401 thru 2501 Washington Street, 1400 thru 1522 Lincoln Street, 1503 thru 1527 Garden Plaza, and 1502 thru 1526 Garden Plaza, 1505 Lyon Street, 1510 Lyon Street, 1527 Lyon Street, 2377 Washington Street, TMS#11411-04-01 thru 46, 11411-05-01 thru 12, 11411-05-22 thru 30, 11411-03-01 thru 03, and 11411-03-10;** had been deferred.

- 17. SPAN-2020-0010: 2.74 acres S/W Rugby Road (portion), 0.31 acres E/S Rugby Road, 4802 Brickyard Road (portion), 320 Club Road, 0.38 acres W/S Rugby Road, 4848 Rugby Road, and 4860 Rugby Road, TMS# 09212-01-01 (portion), 09212-02-01, 09212-02-12 (portion), 09305-04-18, 09305-04-19, 09309-15-08, and 09309-15-11;** request site plan approval to construct a 91-Unit Multifamily Development (Greater Columbia CDC). The properties are currently zoned RG-1 (General Residential) and RS-HD (Residential, Single-Family - High Density) in Richland County.

Mr. Fellows reviewed the site plan application for the Commission. Mr. John Lewis, New Path Development and Consulting, presented the application on behalf of their client, Grace Christian Ministries. The project consists of a proposed 91-unit townhome complex on the site, which consists of 13 buildings of 7 units each, at 1,360 square feet, with the main entrance for the property off of Club Road. Two parking spaces will be provided per unit. Phase 1 and 2 environmental reviews have been completed, and they have entered into a voluntary cleanup plan with SCDHEC, and are currently working on a workplan.

Dr. Mandell asked if City Council had approved first reading, and Mr. Fellows indicated they had, and that second reading was pending. Mr. Tupper asked the applicant if a traffic study had been completed; they indicated one had not been required or completed. Mr. Johnathan Chambers, Land Development Administrator, indicated that the Traffic Engineer had reviewed and approved the plan and did not require a traffic study.

Chairman Stigamier asked for Public Comment. Mr. Livengood indicated there were members of the public wishing to speak.

Mr. Anthony Kelly, 4850 Brickyard Road, spoke regarding the request. He indicated he had concerns regarding the stormwater runoff and environmental concerns.

Mr. Fellows asked Mr. Livengood to document the emails that had already been sent to the PC members. Ms. Bailey indicated letters that went to the Commission were received prior to today, and were Syrecea Parker, Henry Parker, and Sarah Parker.

Mr. Livengood indicated that additional speakers had raised their hands to speak.

Mr. Victor Rodgers noted he had sent in a series of faxes expressing concern regarding the application, one from him, from his parents (Mr. & Mrs. Carl Rodgers), and from his sister. He indicated that he had sent an email as well. He indicated he was not in favor of the application. He noted the fax from his parents indicated the land would be better suited for a park. He indicated he was in favor of a traffic study and had concerns regarding traffic.

Ms. Vonda Rice, 5001 Rugby Road, spoke in opposition to the request. She indicated she had concerns regarding traffic safety, lighting, trash, environmental contaminants, and the proposed density.

Ms. Syrecea Parker indicated she had concerns regarding Mr. Lewis' comments regarding the contamination. Ms. Parker indicated she was very concerned regarding the environmental contamination. She also indicated she was concerned about increased traffic as a result of the proposed project.

Mr. Livengood indicated he had no further phone comments, but that he did have several emails.

An email received from B.J. Sumpter, president of the Club Road / Barony Woods Neighborhood Association, expressed opposition to the request, specific to crime, safety, and environmental concerns.

An email received from Zipporah Sumpter, expressed opposition to the request, citing traffic volume and safety concerns, and detrimental impacts to the community. Her email further noted concerns regarding the environmental contamination of the property.

An email received from Jada Harris voiced opposition to the request.

An email received from furticksd@ (no name was provided), voiced opposition to the request, citing traffic and density concerns.

An email received from Kieana Parker, US Navy Corpsman, who grew up in the Barony Woods subdivision, spoke in opposition to the request, noting concerns regarding traffic and density.

Mr. Livengood indicated that there were no further public comments via email, voicemail, or telephone.

Dr. Mandell indicated there seemed to be a number of questions and concerns that hadn't been further addressed, especially with regard to contamination. Mr. Fellows indicated that the Phase 1 and 2 environmental studies were attached to the agenda, however the regulatory body that has purview regarding environmental contamination is SCDHEC. Mr. Chambers noted that A.J. Jessee's comments spoke specifically to SCDHEC and EPA regulations regarding mitigation of the contaminants. Dr. Mandell asked for clarification that SCDHEC would need to provide separate approval for development of the site, and Mr. Chambers confirmed that was the case.

Mr. Lewis indicated he would like to respond to these concerns, and that they (the applicant) had entered into a verbal contract with SCDHEC for the cleanup of the land after completing an initial conversation with SCDHEC. He indicated that their engineer was currently working on completing a workplan for the remediation, and this workplan will be submitted to SCDHEC for review once completed.

Mr. Livengood indicated that a prior speaker has raised their hand again. Ms. Syrecea Parker indicated her concern was that the applicant had not been forthcoming with the information regarding the environmental review findings. She asked that the Commission postpone the vote until SCDHEC had completed their review.

Mr. Frost asked the applicant if SCDHEC had provided any indication of the timeframe on the approval process for the Voluntary Cleanup Contract (VCC). Mr. Lewis indicated that they did not have an indication from SCDHEC at this time, but were moving forward with them to sign a written contract this week, and then will be following up with a conversation regarding the proposed workplan. Following that, groundwater sampling will need to occur to determine what actions they will take next.

Mr. Chambers was able to reenter the meeting via telephone. Dr. Mandell asked Mr. Chambers to clarify the process. Mr. Chambers noted that the case summary that was provided as part of the agenda included the Phase 1 & 2 studies, and that the City's Engineering Department and Stormwater Division had reviewed the studies, and indicated that SCDHEC would still regulate the mitigation of contaminants on the site, and that the City will not issue any permits to construct until the necessary permits have been received from the State and federal government.

Chairman Stigamier asked for a motion. Ms. James moved to approve the site plan subject to staff comments. Lacking a second, the motion failed. Chairman Stigamier asked for another motion. Dr. Mandell moved to deny the site plan. Mr. Chambers asked for clarification regarding the motion to deny. Dr. Mandell asked to remove her motion, and the Chairman confirmed. Ms. Mandell moved that the action be deferred, Ms. James seconded the motion. Ms. Mandell indicated she remained concerned about the density, traffic issues, and ongoing disagreement between the surrounding neighborhood and developer. Mr. Tupper asked if an alternative for additional access to the property could be regarded, specific to traffic concerns. Ms. Harts and Ms. Mandell indicated they agreed they would desire a traffic study for further information.

Mr. Livengood noted that Mr. Anthony Kelly had raised his hand to speak. Mr. Fellows indicated that there was a motion on the table, so that may need to be acted upon prior to taking any additional comment. Mr. Livengood indicated he also just received a voicemail. Chairman Stigamier indicated he would like to take action on the deferral motion prior to taking additional comments. Mr. Fellows called the roll; the motion to defer was approved by unanimous vote. He also advised the Commission that they may wish to provide an additional, more specific motion as well.

Mr. Livengood played the voicemail, from Shirley Ferdick in the Eau Claire Community. She indicated she had a question regarding the application. She indicated she understood the property to be in the County, and was confused as to the City's consideration of the application. Mr. Fellows indicated that the property is actually half in the City of Columbia, and half outside of the City. The applicant has requested annexation of the portion that is currently not within the City. Mr. Lewis clarified that the church was located within the City limits as well.

Mr. Anthony Kelly, connected via telephone, asked about the multicolored water that is already coming down from Grace Ministries, from underneath the ground, and asked if the developer had looked at this concern.

Mr. Stigamier asked for an additional motion. Mr. Tupper made a motion requesting a traffic study of the applicant, to include alternate ingresses to and egresses from the property. Ms. Mandell seconded the motion. Mr. Frost added that they would like to be able to formally review the cleanup contract from SCDHEC once completed. The motion passed 5 to 1 (AYE: Stigamier, Mandell, Frost, Harts, Tupper; NAY: James).

Mr. Frost made a motion that the Planning Commission review the Voluntary Cleanup Contract from SCDHEC once completed. Ms. Harts seconded the motion. The motion was carried by unanimous vote.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Election of Chair and Vice Chair: Mr. Fellows asked for nominations for Chair. Ms. Mandell asked for clarification regarding members that were rolling off. Chairman Stigamier indicated he wished to no longer serve as Chair, and nominated Mr. Frost. There being no other nominations, Mr. Frost was elected Chair. Ms. James nominated herself for Vice Chair. There being no other nominations, Ms. James was elected Vice Chair.

V. ADJOURN

Ms. James made a motion to adjourn, and Mr. Frost seconded the motion. The motion was carried by unanimous vote, and the meeting was adjourned at 7:18pm.

**Respectfully submitted,
Planning & Development Services Department**